



# Toward a Gold Standard for Diversity and Inclusion (D&I) Maturity Measurement

A Narrative Literature Review  
(NLR) and Insights for Future  
Research

---

Elizabeth A. Sweigart  
The Chicago School of Professional Psychology



# Author note

---



Zachary S. Nunn, co-founder of Living Corporate, LLC, provided valuable feedback and insight on an early draft of this study.



No known conflicts of interest to disclose.



Correspondence concerning this presentation should be addressed to Liz Sweigart at [esweigart@ego.thechicagoschool.edu](mailto:esweigart@ego.thechicagoschool.edu).

# Problem and purpose

- Problem
  - Despite the proliferation of diversity and inclusion (D&I) programs and initiatives in both the public and private sectors, there is no broadly accepted empirical instrument shown to measure the tendency of individuals to demonstrate inclusive behavior in an organization.
- Purpose
  1. Survey and analyze the diversity, equity, and inclusion literature, systematically, to understand existing instruments and tools for measuring inclusive behavior in organizations.
  2. Develop advice, guidance, and recommendations for future research and inquiry based on observations from the literature.

# Method

---



Identified initial articles from Internet search (Turnbull et al., 2011) and developed search criteria for additional sources.



Searched 6 electronic databases—PsycINFO, JSTOR, ProQuest, Academic Search Premier (EBSCO), ABI/INFORM Global, WorldCat.org—and 1 online search engine, Google Scholar.



Scanned abstracts for 415 potential sources, selected 34 for detailed review (24 journal articles, 5 dissertations, 3 conference proceedings, 1 book chapter, 1 government report).



Reviewed refined set of 34 sources in detail, synthesized existing literature, identified relationships and gaps across sources, and developed point of view regarding future research. Also, identified limitations to this study.

# Search criteria, delimitations

- Robust and rigorous: Peer-reviewed articles, chapters from textbooks, dissertation (master or doctoral), conference proceedings, government publications.
- Contextually relevant: Published post-9/11. The September 11 attacks radically altered the D&I narrative with respect to race, ethnicity, immigration status, and religious affiliation, particularly in the United States, where most studies on this topic have been conducted (Rodriguez, 2008).
- Both keywords represented in title and abstract: Although inconsistently defined across the literature, when only one term appears prominently, it strongly suggests an incomplete understanding of the concepts.
- Specific focus on measurement: Majority of D&I studies are statistical analyses of demographics.

# Results, findings, discussion



Inconsistent definitions.



Centered Whiteness and proactively managed White Fragility (DiAngelo, 2011).



Most instruments were created by the researcher(s), lack longitudinal results and often demonstrated poor reliability, validity, generalizability.



Significance of historical context seemingly unrecognized in US studies (e.g., 2001, 2008, 2012, 2015).



Heavy on opinion, light on substance (Eagly, 2016).

# Strengths and limitations

---



First-of-its-kind comprehensive review of inclusion measurement tools in the literature.



Large sample of sources gathered from multiple databases.



Inconsistency of definitions and frequency of term usage presented coding challenges.



US-focused, generalizability unclear.

A 3D rendering of a puzzle with one red piece standing out among many white pieces. The red piece is in the center, and the white pieces are arranged around it, some of which are missing, creating a sense of a puzzle in progress. The lighting is soft, highlighting the edges and the glossy surface of the pieces.

## Avenues of future inquiry

---

- Formalized definitions of key terms.
- Articulation of policy and practice aims for D&I.
- Mediating Whiteness and White Fragility in D&I studies.



# References

- Alhejji, H., Garavan, T., Carbery, R., O'Brien, F., & McGuire, D. (2016). Diversity training programme outcomes: A systematic review. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 27(1), 95-149. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrdq.21221>
- Allen, R. S., Dawson, G., Wheatley, K., & White, C. S. (2008). Perceived diversity and organizational performance. *Employee Relations*, 30(1), 20-33. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/01425450810835392>
- Anderson, W., Hayashi, R., & Frost, C. (2009). Measuring the diversity awareness of social work students: The dual perspective inventory. *Journal of Teaching in Social Work*, 29(3), 258-270.
- April, K., & Blass, E. (2010). Measuring diversity practice and developing inclusion. *Dimensions*, 1(1), 59-66.
- Bendick, M., Jr. (2008). Measure inclusion, not diversity. Society for Human Resource Management National Diversity Conference.
- Burkard, A. W., Boticki, M. A., & Madson, M. B. (2002). Workplace discrimination, prejudice, and diversity measurement: A review of instrumentation. *Journal of Career Assessment*, 10(3), 343-361. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10672702010003005>

# References (continued)

- Carstens, J. G., & De Kock, F. S. (2017). Firm-level diversity management competencies: Development and initial validation of a measure. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 28(15), 2109-2135. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2015.1128460>
- Chavez, C. I., & Weisinger, J. Y. (2008). Beyond diversity training: A social infusion for cultural inclusion. *Human Resource Management*, 47(2), 331-350. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrm.20215>
- Chen, C. C., & Hooijberg, R. (2000). Ambiguity intolerance and support for valuing-diversity interventions. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 30(11), 2392-2408. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1559-1816.2000.tb02442.x>
- Cox, T. H., Jr., & Blake, S. (1991). Managing cultural diversity: Implications for organizational competitiveness. *Academy of Management Executive*, 5(3), 45-56. <https://doi.org/10.5465/AME.1991.4274465>
- Curcio, A., Ward, T., & Dogra, N. (2014). A survey instrument to develop, tailor, and help measure law student cultural diversity education learning outcomes. *Nova Law Review*, 38(2), 176-247.
- Davidson, A. (2019). *Developing a nonprofit board for diversity, equity, and inclusion: An effective tool for measuring a boards vulnerabilities, readiness, and integrity* [Master of Nonprofit Administration, University of San Francisco]. WorldCat.org. San Francisco, California. <https://repository.usfca.edu/capstone/895>

# References (continued)

- De Meuse, K. P., & Hostager, T. J. (2001). Developing an instrument for measuring attitudes toward and perceptions of workplace diversity: An initial report. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 12(1), 33-51.
- Dean, S. R. (2014). *Development and validation of a multicultural consciousness instrument* [University of Georgia]. WorldCat.org. Athens, Georgia. [http://purl.galileo.usg.edu/uga\\_etd/dean\\_shannon\\_r\\_201405\\_phd](http://purl.galileo.usg.edu/uga_etd/dean_shannon_r_201405_phd)
- den Brok, P., van Eerde, D., & Hajer, M. (2010). Classroom interaction studies as a source for teacher competencies: The use of case studies with multiple instruments for studying teacher competencies in multicultural classes. *Teachers and Teaching*, 16(6), 717-733.
- DeNisi, A. S. (2014). An i/o psychologist's perspective on diversity and inclusion in the workplace. In B. M. Ferdman & B. R. Deane (Eds.), *Diversity at work: The practice of inclusion* (pp. 564-579). Jossey-Bass.
- Derven, M. (2013). Measure diversity and inclusion for maximum impact. *T+D*, 67(12), 16.
- DiAngelo, R. (2011). White fragility. *International Journal of Critical Pedagogy*, 3(3), 54-70.
- Doyle, R., & George, U. (2008). Achieving and measuring diversity: An organizational change approach. *Social Work Education*, 27(1), 97-110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02615470601141235>

# References (continued)

- Eagly, A. H. (2016). When passionate advocates meet research on diversity, does the honest broker stand a chance? *Journal of Social Issues, 72*(1), 199-222. <https://doi.org/10.1111/josi.12163>
- Fairbairn, S. B., & Fox, J. (2009). Inclusive achievement testing for linguistically and culturally diverse test takers: Essential considerations for test developers and decision makers. *Educational Measurement: Issues and Practice, 28*(1), 10-24.
- Forlin, C., Earle, C., Loreman, T., & Sharma, U. (2011). The sentiments, attitudes, and concerns about inclusive education revised (SACIE-R) scale for measuring pre-service perceptions teachers' perception about inclusion. *Exceptionality Education International, 21*(3), 50-65.
- Gilbert, J. A., & Ivancevich, J. M. (2000). Valuing diversity: A tale of two organizations. *Academy of Management Executive, 14*(1), 93-105. <https://doi.org/10.5465/AME.2000.2909842>
- Gilbert, J. A., Stead, B. A., & Ivancevich, J. M. (1999). Diversity management: A new organizational paradigm. *Journal of Business Ethics, 21*(1), 61-76.
- Giovannini, M. (2004). What gets measured gets done: Achieving results through diversity and inclusion. *The Journal for Quality and Participation, 27*(4), 21-27.

# References (continued)

- Haines, E. L., & Sumner, K. E. (2006). Implicit measurement of attitudes, stereotypes, and self-concepts in organizations: Teaching old dogmas new tricks. *Organizational Research Methods, 9*(4), 536-553.
- Hermisson, S., Gochyev, P., & Wilson, M. (2019). Assessing pupils' attitudes towards religious and worldview diversity - development and validation of a nuanced measurement instrument. *British Journal of Religious Education, 41*(4), 371-387. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2018.1556604> (British Journal of Religious Education)
- Howze, P. C. (2013). *On institutional diversity and inclusive excellence in higher education: A theoretical and conceptual framework for measuring the effectiveness of programs and services*. 21st Annual Joint Conference of the National Association of African American Studies, National Association of Hispanic and Latino Studies, National Association of Native American Studies, and International Association of Asian Studies, Baton Rouge, LA.
- Jansen, W. S., Otten, S., Zee, K. I., & Jans, L. (2014). Inclusion: Conceptualization and measurement. *European Journal of Social Psychology, 44*(4), 370-385. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ejsp.2011>
- Johnson, D., Clarkson, J., & Huppert, F. (2010). Capability measurement for inclusive design. *Journal of Engineering Design, 21*(2/3), 275-288. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09544820903303464>
- Krentzman, A. R., & Townsend, A. L. (2008). Review of multidisciplinary measures of cultural competence for use in social work education. *Journal of Social Work Education, 44*(2), 7-31. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.5175/JSWE.2008.200600003>

# References (continued)

- Luevanos, E. A. (2018). *Inclusive or not?: Development of a student survey to measure students' perspectives of teacher and leader abilities to lead racially diverse schools* Texas A&M University]. College Station, TX.
- Maloney, D. (2014). Our obsession with online quizzes comes from fear, not narcissism. *Wired*. <https://www.wired.com/2014/03/buzzfeed-quizzes/>
- Marshall, D. (2008). How can HR measure the success of diversity initiatives? *Strategic HR Review*, 7(5), 42-43. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/shr.2008.37207eaf.005>
- Maturo, F., Migliori, S., & Paolone, F. (2019). Measuring and monitoring diversity in organizations through functional instruments with an application to ethnic workforce diversity of the U.S. Federal agencies. *Computational and Mathematical Organization Theory*, 25(4), 357-388. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10588-018-9267-7>
- Milliken, F. J., & Martins, L. L. (1996). Searching for common threads: Understanding the multiple effects of diversity in organizational groups. *The Academy of Management Review*, 21(2), 402-433.
- Mor Barak, M. E., Lizano, E., Kim, A., Duan, L., Rhee, M.-K., Hsiao, H.-Y., & Brimhall, K. (2016). The promise of diversity management for climate of inclusion: A state-of-the-art review and meta-analysis. *Human Service Organizations: Management, Leadership & Governance*, 40(4), 305-333. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23303131.2016.1138915>
- Nelson Laird, T. F. (2011). Measuring the diversity inclusivity of college courses. *Research in Higher Education*, 52(6), 572-588. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11162-010-9210-3>

# References (continued)

Paskoff, S. M. (1996). Ending the workplace diversity wars. *Training*, 33(8), 42-47.

Person, S. D., Jordan, C. G., Allison, J. J., Fink Ogawa, L. M., Castillo-Page, L., Conrad, S., Nivet, M. A., & Plummer, D. L. (2015). Measuring diversity and inclusion in academic medicine: The diversity engagement survey. *Academic Medicine*, 90(12), 1675-1683. <https://doi.org/10.1097/acm.0000000000000921>

Pless, N., & Maak, T. (2004). Building an inclusive diversity culture: Principles, processes and practice. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 54(2), 129-147. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10551-004-9465-8>

Potter, M. (2018). Measuring inclusion in political life: A framework for analysis. *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics*, 24(3), 324-335. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13537113.2018.1489560>

Roberson, Q. M. (2006). Disentangling the meanings of diversity and inclusion in organizations. *Group & Organization Management*, 31(2), 212-236.

Rodriguez, R. M. (2008). (Dis)unity and diversity in post-9/11 America. *Sociological Forum*, 23(2), 379-389. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1573-7861.2008.00068.x>

# References (continued)

- Rogge, N., & Self, R. (2019). Measuring regional social inclusion performances in the EU: Looking for unity in diversity. *Journal of European Social Policy, 29*(3), 325-344.  
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0958928718792135>
- Stutz, J., & Massengale, R. (1997). Measuring diversity initiatives. *HRMagazine, 42*(12), 85-90.
- Tan, D. L., Morris, L., & Romero, J. (1996). Changes in attitude after diversity training. *Training & Development, 50*(9), 54-55.
- Taylor, A. R., Lee, W. C., Matusovich, H. M., Hampton, C., & Lutz, B. D. (2018). *A failed attempt to develop a measure of engineering students' subjective task-value for diversity and inclusion in engineering*. ASEE Annual Conference and Exposition.
- Thomas, D. A., & Ely, R. J. (1996). Making differences matter: A new paradigm for managing diversity. *Harvard Business Review, 74*(5), 79-90.



# References (continued)

- Turnbull, H., Greenwood, R., Tworoger, L., & Golden, C. (2010). Skill deficiencies in diversity and inclusion in organizations: Developing an inclusion skills measurement. *Academy of Strategic Management Journal, 9*(1), 1-14.
- Turnbull, H., Greenwood, R., Tworoger, L., & Golden, C. (2011). The inclusion skills measurement profile: Validating an assessment for identification of skill deficiencies in diversity and inclusion. *Journal of Organizational Culture, Communications and Conflict, 15*(1), 11-24.
- Wilson, Y. D. (2014). *Promoting diversity, creating inclusion: How are progressive graduate theological schools measuring up?* (Publication Number 3635767) [Ed.D., University of Pennsylvania]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- Young, C., Pyke, J., Maharaj, N., Rasmussen, B., & Jones, R. (2018). *Diversity and inclusion: Building strength and capability literature review.* (1862727805). Victoria, Australia: Bushfire and Natural Hazards CRC.

